



## ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN COMPETITION GUIDELINES

May 1, 2023

Based on suggestions from *The AIA Handbook of Architectural Design Competitions (2019)*

### PREFACE

*What do the White House, the St. Louis Gateway Arch, the World Trade Center Memorial, and the Crown Point Bridge all have in common? Each is the result of an architectural design competition!*

According to the American Institute of Architects (AIA), Design Competitions are an excellent way to

“Generate a wide range of new ideas in the approach to a design” and to  
“Broaden public discourse about design, as well as about the specific project.”

The Ilsley 100 Project Team is pleased to introduce the power of an architectural design competition to help develop a new impetus for the re-creation of Ilsley Public Library. We wish to thank our four competitors for your interest in this effort, and your willingness to apply your creativity and energy to bringing this dream closer to reality.

The firms involved are:

gbArchitecture  
Smith Alvarez Sienkiewicz  
Vermont Integrated Architecture  
Wiemann Lamphere / ReArch

### 1 PURPOSE

What is the Ilsley 100 Project Team’s purpose for conducting a design competition?

We hope to create the ideal facilities to house the Ilsley Public Library for our 2nd century by

- stimulating creative facility/site design ideas from the professional design community that honor our program, context, and budget.
- finding the best partners to assist with our journey through creation into execution.

### 2 PROCESS OVERVIEW

#### A INITIAL ACTIVITIES

- Sign and return a letter of agreement.
- Contact Royce McGrath to schedule one full day of access to building and site to confirm as-builts, ask casual questions. This visit will include access to non-public spaces. Check in at main circulation desk for staff member assistance, and please limit number of team visitors to three.)
- Request CADD drawings file of floor plans from Judith Harris if desired.
- A property survey is underway, and will be provided as soon as it is complete.

**B DESIGN COMPETITION ACTIVITIES*****May 1 through July 7, 2023***

We are excited for this process to begin and are providing the following resources to help you explore your most creative ideas. Our expanded on-line web portal will be available as it was during the RFQ process as a central source for all communications.

<https://www.ilsleypubliclibrary.org/about-us/ilsley-100-project-team-design-competition/>

It will enable exploration of the work that has already been assembled by our team. This is also the place to look for shared answers (FAQs) to individual competitor questions, which can be posed to Judith Harris via her email address throughout the competition. Questions will be answered as soon as practical, in one-week batches.

In particular we encourage you to review the earlier work of the Project Team including the content of the public presentations found on the Ilsley 100 Project Page.

<https://www.ilsleypubliclibrary.org/about-us/ilsley-100-project-team/>

In addition, two key contacts are available to assist you :

Judith Harris, Technical Advisor / Primary Contact and Competitor Support

[judith@harrisandharrisvt.com](mailto:judith@harrisandharrisvt.com)

Royce McGrath, Acting Director of the Ilsley Public Library

[royce.mcgrath@ilsleypubliclibrary.org](mailto:royce.mcgrath@ilsleypubliclibrary.org)

- for scheduled access to non-public library spaces
- for submission of electronic and paper documents per Section 2C below

**C INITIAL SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS:****A FOCUS on CONCEPTS, APPROACHES, and IDEAS!*****July 7, 2023***

The required form of submission shall be anonymous. Two submissions are required on July 7<sup>th</sup> by 2 o'clock pm: 1) electronic submission to Royce McGrath via email address below. 2) paper submission, wrapped (to ensure anonymity) – one full-size copy each of all images with scale indicated. Competitors will be required to convert to uniform paper images mounted on presentation boards/easels for public exhibits at a later date. Submissions shall be entirely devoid of identifying titles, graphics, or references that would allow a reviewer to connect the name of the competitor/firm to the work.

Royce McGrath, Acting Director, Ilsley Public Library will receive electronic submissions via email to [royce.mcgrath@ilsleypubliclibrary.org](mailto:royce.mcgrath@ilsleypubliclibrary.org) by 2 pm on July 7, 2023. By that same time, she will receive paper submissions via mail, courier, or hand-delivery addressed to the Ilsley Library, c/o Royce McGrath at 75 Main Street, Middlebury, Vermont, 05753. Email submissions will then be assigned ID by letters: A.B.C.D. and distributed to the Project Team and the Professional Advisory Group for initial anonymous review. Paper submission copies will likewise be lettered and will be retained on site for reference by the Project Team and Professional Advisory Group.



The following are guidelines of the initial information you are expected to produce so that our evaluation of your efforts can be compared as equivalent in form and level of development. Extra materials may be withheld from the Project Team and Professional Advisory Group, if they appear to violate the framework set forward below.

Competitors shall provide conceptual design information that can be understood and readily compared to our program requirements, site conditions, and downtown context. Clarity should take preference over elaborate renderings for appearance.

**C.1 Project Narrative:** Competitors shall describe their approach to this project in terms of their vision of libraries, IPL's importance to our vibrant community, and how their design approach supports that vision.

**C.2 Minimum Conceptual Drawings:**

**Site Plans** sufficient to understand relationships of building components to their natural and man-made environments within the property boundaries, as well as to immediate neighbors. Vehicular and pedestrian circulation patterns should be considered.

**Floor plan diagrams** sufficient to suggest programmatic uses of all primary spaces and key relationships between them. Include entrances, circulation patterns, sight lines, public and private separations, overhead spaces and reassurance that all program needs can be met by your plans. Include only as much detail as required for clarity.

**Exterior Elevation sketches** as needed for understanding relationships between existing and proposed building components and facades. Alternate elevation material concepts are welcomed for consideration.

**Building sections** sufficient to understand uses by floor level, how they are accessed, and head-height clearances provided.

**Illustrative perspectives or sketches** sufficient to allow visualization of the proposed design concepts by the general public. Color renderings are not required at this time. Interior perspectives for key spaces are left to the discretion of the competitor.

**C.3 Gross area or volume tabulations / Projected Costs**

**STATEMENTS about projected project costs:**

- As this is a public project and must pass a bond vote to proceed, your proposed project design must respect the overall project costs as stated in our RFQ. Included in each submission shall be the cost estimates for the project as illustrated, and the basis for that estimate: e.g. professional estimator, or costs per unit: square-footage area / volume. It shall be stated by whom they are prepared.
- The Town of Middlebury reserves the right to hire a separate cost estimator to check for compliance to this submission requirement.

## **STATEMENTS about CODES / COMPLIANCE**

The Town of Middlebury assumes that any professional submitting to this design competition has exercised reasonable efforts to create a project that is buildable, and that can be detailed and constructed to comply with all applicable building codes, zoning ordinances, and regulations of the jurisdictions where the project is located.

- Professionals shall also ensure that proposed changes or adaptations to the original 1924 building conform to The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, in particular the Standards for Rehabilitation, noting that the project will likely require approval from the Vermont Division of Historic Preservation.

## **D INITIAL SUBMISSION REVIEWS:**

Following receipt of submissions by the Acting Library Director Royce McGrath, anonymous copies will be provided to members of the Ilsey 100 Project Team and the Professional Advisory Group for review. Copies will also be provided to library staff and Board of Trustees members for their review and comment. These comments will be collected and collated by Royce McGrath.

## **E IN-PERSON PRESENTATIONS**

- E.1** All four competitors will present separately to the Project Team and the Professional Advisory Group in a two-hour time-slot. Presentations should not exceed 45 minutes, to allow adequate time for Q&A. *July 25 and July 27, 2023*

- E.2** Static presentations will be displayed in the Town Offices or Library Lobby. Comment cards will be available to the public. *July 28-August 8, 2023*

- E.3** All four competitors will present to the Selectboard and public as part of a single meeting. They will then receive and respond to questions at their respective exhibit locations. Public exhibits shall be provided at specific scales/sizes/formats to allow for ease of comparison by a large general audience. Attendees will have the opportunity to submit comments in writing. *August 9, 2023*

Note regarding E Presentations: At this point presentations are no longer anonymous, nor are they required to be static or equivalent to other competitors in scale, form, or content. You may use whatever means and methods you wish to convey the content and excitement of your entry. In-person presentation times at the large public meeting will be limited.

At this point any competition obligations for the competitors are complete. You will be paid \$5K each for your participation.

- F**      **Ilsley 100 Project Team conducts final rankings** ***August 17, 2023***  
Based on its own perceptions, the opinions of the Professional Advisory Group, and the responses of library staff, Trustees, Selectboard members, and the general public, the Project Team will determine the firm(s) to receive the RFP.
- G**      **The Project Team prepares an RFP for development into full schematics.** Team shares RFP with Selectboard and requests permission to release at their August 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting to proceed to Step H. Physical Exhibits are returned to those not selected. ***August 22, 2023***
- H**      **Team releases RFP** ***August 24, 2023***
- I**      **Team selects preferred schematic design proposal,** requests permission from Selectboard for Town Administration to engage in Contract Negotiations  
***September 5, 2023***
- J**      **Town Manager and Team request approval of Selectboard** to allow chosen team to proceed with schematic design & prepare cost estimate for proposed bond vote, March 2024.  
***September 19, 2023***

**3      LEGAL REQUIREMENTS:**

A Participation Agreement is required to be signed by each competitor prior to full engagement in this Design Competition. This proposed letter has been emailed to each competitor for your review. Please return no later than May 9, 2023.

## **APPENDIX      ILSLEY PUBLIC LIBRARY REPRESENTATIVES**

The following information is provided in the interest of transparency. However, participants should communicate through the approved channels only, and are requested to not contact individuals listed below during the process.

### **Competition Sponsor: Town of Middlebury**

#### **Ilsley 100 Project Team**

##### **Voting Members:**

##### *Library Board of Trustees Representatives*

Joe McVeigh, Team Chair

Amy Mincher

##### *Selectboard Representatives*

Dan Brown

Farhad Kahn

##### *Public Representatives*

Barbara Doyle-Wilch

Jim Gish

Ken Perine

Ruth Hardy (Alternate for Ken Perine)

##### **Non-Voting Members:**

Dana Hart, Director

Beth Dow, Town Administration Liaison

Judith Harris, Technical Advisor

#### **Professional Advisory Group (PAG)**

Glenn Andres, Professor Emeritus, History of Art & Architecture,  
Middlebury College

Tom Keefe, Preservation Architect (ret.)

Former Chair, Vermont Advisory Council for Historic Preservation

David Hamilton, Prof Harvard Grad School of Design / Urban Planning  
Chair, Design Review Board, Town of Middlebury

#### **Ilsley Public Library Board of Trustees**

Amy Mincher, President

Joe McVeigh, Treasurer

Meg Baker, Secretary

Claire Tebbs

Natasha Sen

#### **IPL Primary Staff**

Dana Hart, Library Director (on leave)

Royce McGrath, Acting Library Director

Chris Kirby, Adult & Technical Services Librarian

Tricia Allen, Youth Librarian

Hayley Coble, Circulation Librarian